



**Risk-Informed, Performance Based Industrial Fire Protection**  
An Alternative to Prescriptive Codes by Thomas F. Barry, P.E.

## Table of Contents



Preface .....	v
From the Author .....	vii
Acknowledgments .....	ix
Acronyms .....	xxiii

### Chapter 1 – PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

1.1	INTRODUCTION .....	1 – 1
	1.1.1 Risk Defined .....	1 – 2
	<i>Unmitigated Risk Versus Mitigated Risk</i> .....	1 – 4
1.2	RISK-BASED DECISION MAKING .....	1 – 6
1.3	METHODOLOGY AND STEPS .....	1 – 9
	1.3.1 Risk-Informed, Performance-Based Fire Protection Steps .....	1 – 12
	1.3.2 Comparison with the SFPE Performance-Based Approach .....	1 – 18
1.4	PROJECT MANAGEMENT ISSUES .....	1 – 19
	1.4.1 Project Definition .....	1 – 20
	1.4.2 Project Team Selection .....	1 – 20
	1.4.3 Resource Allocation .....	1 – 22
1.5	RISK COMMUNICATION .....	1 – 25
1.6	REFERENCES .....	1 – 27

### Chapter 2 – RISK TOLERANCE CRITERIA

---

2.1	INTRODUCTION .....	2 – 1
	2.1.1 Bottom-Up or Top-Down Approach .....	2 – 2
	2.1.2 Risk Tolerance Objectives .....	2 – 3
2.2	FINANCIAL IMPACT RISK TOLERANCE .....	2 – 6
	2.2.1 Annualized Financial Impact Risk .....	2 – 6
	<i>Fire and Explosion Viewed as a Financial Risk</i> .....	2 – 6
2.3	EXPOSURE LEVEL RISK TOLERANCE .....	2 – 13
	2.3.1 Life Safety Risk Tolerance .....	2 – 13
	2.3.2 Business Interruption Risk Tolerance .....	2 – 22
	2.3.3 Establishing Consequence Categories .....	2 – 25
	<i>Property Damage</i> .....	2 – 26
	<i>Environmental Damage</i> .....	2 – 26
	2.3.4 Establishing Likelihoods .....	2 – 27
	2.3.5 Discussion on Loss Expectancy .....	2 – 29
	<i>The Move Towards Risk-Based Loss Expectancy Estimates</i> ..	2 – 30
2.4	SOME KEY POINTS .....	2 – 32
2.5	REFERENCES .....	2 – 33

## Chapter 3 – LOSS SCENARIO DEVELOPMENT

3.1	INTRODUCTION .....	3 – 1
3.2	SEQUENCE OF EVENTS .....	3 – 2
	3.2.1 Some Examples .....	3 – 7
3.3	EVENT TREE STRUCTURING .....	3 – 9
	3.3.1 ETA Steps .....	3 – 10
	3.3.2 Example Industrial Building ETA Structure .....	3 – 20
	3.3.3 Example Exterior Exposure ETA Structure .....	3 – 23
	3.3.4 Example Off-Site Risk ETA Structure .....	3 – 25
3.4	SCENARIO SCREENING .....	3 – 28
	3.4.1 Phase 1, Extensive List of Scenarios .....	3 – 29
	3.4.2 Phase 2, Scenario Grouping .....	3 – 30
	3.4.3 Phase 3, Scenario Screening .....	3 – 34
	<i>Risk Screening Approach</i> .....	3 – 34
	<i>Risk Screening Matrix</i> .....	3 – 36
	<i>Action Item Summary</i> .....	3 – 38

	3.4.4 Phase 4, Selection of Scenarios for Quantitative Analysis . . . . .	3 – 39
	3.4.5 Fire Event Classification . . . . .	3 – 39
3.5	DISCUSSION . . . . .	3 – 42
	<i>Site Surveys &amp; Interviews</i> . . . . .	3 – 43
	<i>Historical Data Review</i> . . . . .	3 – 43
3.6	REFERENCES . . . . .	3 – 44

## Chapter 4 – INITIATING EVENT LIKELIHOOD

4.1	INTRODUCTION . . . . .	4 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i> . . . . .	4 – 3
4.2	HISTORICAL DATA . . . . .	4 – 6
	<i>Plant Specific Incident Data</i> . . . . .	4 – 6
	4.2.1 Industry Specific Incident Data . . . . .	4 – 12
	<i>Example of Some Historical Data</i> . . . . .	4 – 16
	4.2.2 Use of Failure Rate Data . . . . .	4 – 18
	<i>Combining Failure Rates from Multiple Data Bases</i> . . . . .	4 – 21
4.3	FAULT TREE ANALYSIS (FTA) . . . . .	4 – 24
	4.3.1 Fault Tree Basics . . . . .	4 – 27
	<i>FTA Steps</i> . . . . .	4 – 29
	4.3.2 Qualitative Fault Tree Structuring . . . . .	4 – 35
	4.3.3 FTA Computer Software . . . . .	4 – 38
4.4	EQUIPMENT FAILURES . . . . .	4 – 39
	4.4.1 Failure Data Sources . . . . .	4 – 41
	<i>Plant Specific Data</i> . . . . .	4 – 41
	<i>Equipment Manufacturers' Data</i> . . . . .	4 – 42
	<i>Published Failure Rate Data</i> . . . . .	4 – 43
	4.4.2 Pre-Fire Mitigation Safeguards . . . . .	4 – 51
	<i>Emergency Control Systems</i> . . . . .	4 – 52
	4.4.3 Modifying Equipment Failure Rate Data . . . . .	4 – 55
	<i>Performance Integrity Measures (PIMs)</i> . . . . .	4 – 56
	<i>An Overview of Some (PIMs)</i> . . . . .	4 – 57
	<i>PIM Quality Scoring</i> . . . . .	4 – 61
	<i>Relating PIM GPA Score to Failure Point Selection</i> . . . . .	4 – 65
4.5	HUMAN ERROR . . . . .	4 – 68
	4.5.1 Human Error Data . . . . .	4 – 70
4.6	EXTERNAL EVENTS . . . . .	4 – 72

---

4.6.1	Earthquake	4 – 73
4.6.2	Security	4 – 75
4.7	OXYGEN AVAILABILITY	4 – 75
4.7.1	Oxygen Concentration Reduction	4 – 77
	<i>Combustible Dust</i>	4 – 79
4.8	IGNITION	4 – 81
4.8.1	Ignition Fault Tree Logic	4 – 82
	<i>Ignition Source of Sufficient Strength is Present in Exposure Zone</i>	4 – 83
4.8.2	Ignition Source Identification	4 – 85
	<i>Industry and Generic Incident Data Bases</i>	4 – 92
4.8.3	Ignition Source Strength	4 – 93
	<i>Autoignition Temperature</i>	4 – 93
	<i>Time Ignition Source is Present</i>	4 – 97
	<i>Ignition Source Control Systems</i>	4 – 98
4.8.4	Ignition Likelihood and Engineering Judgement	4 – 100
	<i>Likelihood Selection Basis</i>	4 – 102
4.8.5	Summary	4 – 105
4.9	LIKELIHOOD CATEGORIZATION	4 – 106
4.9.1	Scenario Input	4 – 109
4.9.2	Historical Data Bandwidth	4 – 110
4.9.3	Control System Reliability	4 – 111
4.9.4	Ignition Source Potential	4 – 114
4.9.5	Establishing Fire Event Frequency and Likelihood Category Ranges	4 – 114
4.9.6	Documentation	4 – 117
4.10	DISCUSSION	4 – 120
4.11	REFERENCES	4 – 122

## Chapter 5 – EXPOSURE PROFILE MODELING

5.1	INTRODUCTION	5 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	5 – 3
5.1.1	Exposure Profile Modeling Approach	5 – 4
5.2	TARGET THRESHOLD DAMAGE LIMITS	5 – 7
5.2.1	Life Safety Exposure and TDLs	5 – 9
	<i>Radiant Heat</i>	5 – 10
	<i>Convective Heat Exposure</i>	5 – 11

---

	<i>Effects of Oxygen Depletion</i> .....	5 – 13
	<i>Toxic Products of Combustion</i> .....	5 – 13
	<i>Visibility Through Smoke</i> .....	5 – 15
5.2.2	Property Threshold Damage Limits .....	5 – 15
	<i>Equipment</i> .....	5 – 16
	<i>Stock</i> .....	5 – 17
	<i>Structures</i> .....	5 – 18
	<i>Radiant Heat Exposure</i> .....	5 – 19
	<i>Electrical Cables</i> .....	5 – 23
	<i>Electronic Equipment</i> .....	5 – 24
	<i>Glass</i> .....	5 – 24
	<i>Steel</i> .....	5 – 25
	<i>Concrete</i> .....	5 – 27
	<i>Example TDL Worksheet</i> .....	5 – 28
	<i>Modeling and Computer Simulation</i> .....	5 – 29
5.2.3	Explosion Overpressure Effects .....	5 – 33
5.3	TIME LINE PARAMETERS AND CONSEQUENCE LEVELS .....	5 – 37
5.3.1	Evaluating System Functional Requirements .....	5 – 37
5.3.2	Modeling Fire Source Intensity .....	5 – 40
	<i>Exposure to Target Subsystems</i> .....	5 – 40
	<i>Exposure to Control Room Operator</i> .....	5 – 42
	<i>Exposure to Control Room Equipment</i> .....	5 – 45
5.3.3	Damage Limiting Conditions and Time Line Parameters .....	5 – 48
5.3.4	Categorizing Event Tree Consequence Levels .....	5 – 53
	<i>Life Safety</i> .....	5 – 53
	<i>Evasive Action</i> .....	5 – 56
	<i>Property Damage</i> .....	5 – 57
	<i>Business Interruption</i> .....	5 – 60
	<i>Environmental Damage</i> .....	5 – 64
5.4	COMPARTMENT FIRE MODELS .....	5 – 66
5.4.1	Source ÷ Pathway ÷ Target .....	5 – 66
5.4.2	Some Fire Calculation Concepts .....	5 – 70
	<i>Flame Height</i> .....	5 – 71
	<i>Fire Plume/Ceiling Jet Correlations</i> .....	5 – 72
5.4.3	Zone Fire Models .....	5 – 74
5.4.4	Issues and Limitations of Zone Fire Models .....	5 – 76
5.4.5	Field Fire Models .....	5 – 77
	<i>Summary</i> .....	5 – 83
5.5	INITIAL HEAT RELEASE RATE EVALUATION .....	5 – 84
5.5.1	Initial Fuel Source .....	5 – 85

---

5.5.2	Fire Growth of Initial Fuel Package	5 – 88
	<i>t<sup>2</sup> Fire Uncertainty Issues</i>	5 – 90
5.5.3	Peak HRR of the Initial Fuel Package	5 – 90
	<i>Estimating Pool Fire Diameters for Unconfined Spills</i>	5 – 93
	<i>Fire Burning Time</i>	5 – 95
	<i>Torch Fires</i>	5 – 95
5.5.4	Solid Material HRR	5 – 96
5.5.5	Peak HRR Importance	5 – 99
5.6	SECONDARY FUEL SOURCES	5 – 100
5.6.1	Radiant Heat Exposure	5 – 101
	<i>Solid Flame Radiation Model</i>	5 – 104
5.7	SPECIAL HAZARD EXPOSURE MODELING	5 – 109
5.7.1	Characterize the Release	5 – 110
5.7.2	Incident Outcomes	5 – 112
	<i>Ignition</i>	5 – 114
	<i>Blast Wave Generation</i>	5 – 116
	<i>Flame Impingement</i>	5 – 117
5.7.3	Exposure Modeling	5 – 117
	<i>Torch Fire</i>	5 – 117
	<i>BLEVE</i>	5 – 119
	<i>Flash Fire Exposure</i>	5 – 120
	<i>Vapor Cloud Explosion Exposure</i>	5 – 121
5.7.4	Relating Consequence Levels	5 – 122
	<i>Computerized Models</i>	5 – 126
5.8	DISCUSSION	5 – 127
5.9	REFERENCES	5 – 129
	<i>References for Table 5.39, A Listing of Some Field Fire Models, Chap. 5</i>	5 – 132

## Chapter 6 – Fire Protection System Performance Success Probability

6.1	INTRODUCTION	6 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	6 – 3
6.1.1	The Performance Concept	6 – 4
6.1.2	Performance Measures	6 – 7
	<i>Success Tree Analysis</i>	6 – 9
6.1.3	Modeling Framework	6 – 16

---

6.2	RESPONSE EFFECTIVENESS .....	6 – 18
	6.2.1 Design Application Basis .....	6 – 18
	6.2.2 Suitability .....	6 – 20
	<i>Detection Systems</i> .....	6 – 21
	<i>Emergency Control Systems</i> .....	6 – 21
	<i>Fire Suppression Systems</i> .....	6 – 22
	6.2.3 Capacity Effectiveness .....	6 – 23
	6.2.4 Duration .....	6 – 26
	6.2.5 Probability .....	6 – 27
	6.2.6 System Response Time .....	6 – 28
	<i>Refresher</i> .....	6 – 29
	6.2.7 FPS Response Time Evaluation Methods .....	6 – 34
	<i>Deterministic Modeling</i> .....	6 – 34
	6.2.8 SRT Probability Selection .....	6 – 35
	<i>Explosion Suppression Systems</i> .....	6 – 37
	<i>Summary</i> .....	6 – 38
6.3	ON-LINE AVAILABILITY .....	6 – 39
	<i>Performance Measures</i> .....	6 – 41
	6.3.1 Off-Line Due To Inspection, Maintenance, Proof Testing .....	6 – 42
	6.3.2 Off-Line Due To False Trips .....	6 – 43
	6.3.3 Off-Line Due To “Other” Conditions .....	6 – 44
	<i>Adverse Weather Conditions</i> .....	6 – 44
	<i>Unscheduled Repairs</i> .....	6 – 45
6.4	OPERATIONAL RELIABILITY EVALUATION LOGIC .....	6 – 45
	6.4.1 Qualitative Logic Structuring .....	6 – 49
	<i>Automatic Detection Systems</i> .....	6 – 51
	<i>Emergency Control Systems (ECS)</i> .....	6 – 53
	<i>Water-Based Fire Suppression Systems</i> .....	6 – 58
	<i>Fire Barriers</i> .....	6 – 61
	6.4.2 Operational Reliability (OPR) and Common Cause Failures (CCFs) .....	6 – 64
	<i>Internal Design-Related Failure Potential</i> .....	6 – 65
6.5	OPERATIONAL RELIABILITY QUANTIFICATION .....	6 – 67
	6.5.1 Probability Documentation Table .....	6 – 68
	<i>Description</i> .....	6 – 68
	<i>Mean Failure Rate</i> .....	6 – 68
	6.5.2 Performance Integrity Measure (PIM) Failure Rate Adjustment .....	6 – 72
	<i>General Design Standards</i> .....	6 – 75
	<i>Life-Cycle (Age)</i> .....	6 – 75
	<i>Management of Change (MOC) Program</i> .....	6 – 76
	<i>Inspection and Maintenance Programs</i> .....	6 – 76
	<i>Proof Testing</i> .....	6 – 76

---

	<i>Operating Environment</i> .....	6 – 79
	<i>Redundancy</i> .....	6 – 79
	<i>Diagnostics (Fault Detection Capability)</i> .....	6 – 79
	<i>Performance Integrity Measure (PIM) Quality Scoring</i> .....	6 – 80
	<i>Importance</i> .....	6 – 80
6.5.3	Failure Data Sources .....	6 – 89
	<i>Plant Specific Data</i> .....	6 – 89
	<i>Equipment Manufacturers Data</i> .....	6 – 91
	<i>Published Failure Rate Data</i> .....	6 – 92
	<i>Equipment Boundaries</i> .....	6 – 94
	<i>Failure Mode Definition</i> .....	6 – 94
6.6	REDUNDANCY AND INADVERTENT OPERATION .....	6 – 98
	6.6.1 Redundant or Back-Up Equipment .....	6 – 98
	6.6.2 Inadvertent Operation .....	6 – 101
	<i>Inadvertent Operation Data</i> .....	6 – 103
6.7	MANUAL INTERVENTION .....	6 – 104
	6.7.1 Performance Evaluation Factors .....	6 – 106
	<i>Design Application Basis (DAB)</i> .....	6 – 106
	<i>Availability</i> .....	6 – 107
	<i>Human Response Failure</i> .....	6 – 108
	<i>The Reduction of Manual Intervention, Human Error</i> .....	6 – 110
	6.7.2 Fire Fighting .....	6 – 111
6.8	PERFORMANCE INTEGRITY-BASED RELIABILITY LEVELS .....	6 – 114
	6.8.1 Review of Applicable Design Codes, Standards, Practices .....	6 – 115
	6.8.2 Reliability Data Review .....	6 – 116
	6.8.3 Quality Scoring of FPS Performance Integrity Measures .....	6 – 117
	6.8.4 FPS Reliability Estimate .....	6 – 117
6.9	Discussion .....	6 – 119
	<i>Fire Protection System Interfaces</i> .....	6 – 120
	<i>Use of a Computer Program Model</i> .....	6 – 121
	<i>Performance and Risk Management</i> .....	6 – 122
	<i>Summary</i> .....	6 – 122
6.10	REFERENCES .....	6 – 123

**Chapter 7 – RISK ESTIMATION AND COMPARISON**

7.1	INTRODUCTION .....	7 – 1
-----	--------------------	-------

---

	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i> .....	7 – 2
7.2	RISK CALCULATION .....	7 – 3
	7.2.1 Branch Line Probabilities .....	7 – 3
	7.2.2 Aggregate Equivalent Monetary Values .....	7 – 6
	<i>Property Damage</i> .....	7 – 8
	<i>Business Interruption</i> .....	7 – 11
	<i>Life Safety Exposure</i> .....	7 – 13
	<i>Environmental Damage</i> .....	7 – 15
	<i>Other Consequence Considerations</i> .....	7 – 16
	7.2.3 Annualized Risk .....	7 – 17
	<i>Total Annualized Risk</i> .....	7 – 19
	<i>Annualized Risk Grouped by Loss Expectancy Scenarios of Interest</i> .....	7 – 19
	<i>Likelihood of Exceeding a Defined Consequence Level</i> .....	7 – 21
	<i>Risk Summation</i> .....	7 – 23
7.3	RISK COMPARISON .....	7 – 26
	<i>Comparison with the Total Annualized Risk Estimate</i> .....	7 – 26
	<i>Comparison with Loss Expectancy Risk Tolerance Profile</i> .....	7 – 27
	<i>Likelihood of Exceeding a Defined Consequence Level</i> .....	7 – 28
	<i>Life Safety Risk Comparison</i> .....	7 – 29
	<i>Individual Risk Contours</i> .....	7 – 30
7.4	RISK UNCERTAINTY .....	7 – 31
	<i>Interactive Team Reviews</i> .....	7 – 31
	<i>Documentation</i> .....	7 – 34
	7.4.1 Computer Spreadsheet Modeling .....	7 – 37
	<i>What-If Analysis Versus Monte Carlo Simulation</i> .....	7 – 37
	7.4.2 Monte Carlo Simulation .....	7 – 40
	<i>Random Variables and Probability Distribution</i> .....	7 – 42
	<i>A Short Example</i> .....	7 – 43
	<i>Assigning RNG Probability Distributions</i> .....	7 – 44
	<i>Summary</i> .....	7 – 52
7.5	REFERENCES .....	7 – 52

---

## Chapter 8 – COST/BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF RISK REDUCTION ALTERNATIVES

8.1	INTRODUCTION .....	8 – 1
	<i>Weak Links and Brain-Storming</i> .....	8 – 2
8.2	REDUCING INITIATING EVENT LIKELIHOOD .....	8 – 6
	8.2.1 Evaluating Likelihood Reduction .....	8 – 9
	8.2.2 Evaluate the Feasibility of Likelihood Reduction Options .....	8 – 11
	8.2.3 Operator Error .....	8 – 14
	8.2.4 Ignition Likelihood .....	8 – 18
	8.2.5 Quantification of Likelihood Modifications .....	8 – 20
8.3	FIRE PROTECTION SYSTEM PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT ....	8 – 23
	8.3.1 Improving Performance Success of a Water Spray System .....	8 – 30
	<i>Design Application Basis</i> .....	8 – 31
	<i>System Response Time</i> .....	8 – 33
	<i>On-Line Availability</i> .....	8 – 35
	<i>Operational Reliability</i> .....	8 – 36
	<i>Operational Reliability – Performance Integrity Measures</i> ..	8 – 38
	<i>Relating PIM Scores to Failure-On-Demand Probability</i> ....	8 – 40
	<i>Existing Water Spray System – Opportunities for Improvement</i> ..	8 – 46
8.4	CONSEQUENCE MODIFICATION .....	8 – 50
	8.4.1 Material Substitution .....	8 – 50
	<i>Combustible Solids</i> .....	8 – 58
	8.4.2 Modify Life Safety Exposure Levels .....	8 – 58
	8.4.3 Modify Business Interruption (BI) Impact Levels .....	8 – 63
8.5	COST/BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF RISK REDUCTION ALTERNATIVES	8 – 68
	8.5.1 Quantification of Risk Reduction Alternatives .....	8 – 68
	<i>How Much Risk Reduction is Needed?</i> .....	8 – 68
	<i>What-If Analysis</i> .....	8 – 71
	<i>Uncertainty</i> .....	8 – 78
	8.5.2 Cost Analysis for Selected Risk Reduction Strategies .....	8 – 79
	8.5.3 Risk Reduction Benefit/Cost Ratios .....	8 – 84
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 4</i> .....	8 – 85
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 11</i> .....	8 – 86
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 15</i> .....	8 – 86
8.6	DECISION MAKING .....	8 – 87
	<i>Decision Maker’s Preferences</i> .....	8 – 88

	<i>Decision Analysis Tools</i> .....	8 – 89
	<i>Analytic Hierarchy Process</i> .....	8 – 89
	<i>“Pairwise” Comparison</i> .....	8 – 89
8.7	RISK MONITORING .....	8 – 94
	8.7.1 Installation and Start-Up Risk Control .....	8 – 94
	8.7.2 Operational Risk Monitoring .....	8 – 95
	<i>Equipment Inspection, Maintenance, Testing (IMT) Programs</i> .....	8 – 96
	<i>Fire Safety Self-Inspection</i> .....	8 – 97
	8.7.3 FPS Impairments .....	8 – 97
	<i>Assess Fire System Impairment Effects with Event Tree Analysis</i> .....	8 – 98
	8.7.4 Performance Feedback .....	8 – 100
8.8	REFERENCES .....	8 – 101

## **Chapter 9 – MOVING FORWARD**

9.1	INTRODUCTION .....	9 – 1
9.2	TAKING ACTION .....	9 – 3
9.3	FIRE RISK FORUM .....	9 – 5
9.4	REFERENCES .....	9 – 8
	<b>INDEX</b> .....	<b>I – 1</b>